The Strategy Unit.

Forecasting uncertainty



Commissioning Support Unit

80% confidence interval



Exercise

Ten general knowledge questions.

For each question, provide a 80% confidence interval.

In your judgement, there should be

- a 10% chance that the true value lies below the lower limit
- a 10% chance that the true value lies above the upper limit

Don't agonise over it.

This is not a test of your general knowledge.

You must give answers to each question.

		Lower bound 10% chance value is lower	Upper bound 10% chance value is higher	
1	When was Elvis Presley born?			
2	How many miles tall is Mount Everest?			
3	What percentage of the atmosphere is oxygen by weight?			
4	The first European printing press was invented in what year?			
5	What percentage of all electricity consumed by U.S. households in 2001 was used by kitchen appliances?			
6	What percentage of a square could be covered by a circle of the same width?			
7	In what year did Isaac Newton publish the universal laws of gravitation?			
8	At how many miles per hour can a peregrine falcon fly in a dive?			
9	How many calories are in 8 ounces of orange juice?			
10	How many people were permanently evacuated after the Chernobyl nuclear power plant accident?			

Count fel	the number of instances where the answer I between your upper and lower bound	Lower bound 10% chance value is lower	Upper bound 10% chance value is higher	Answer
1	When was Elvis Presley born?			1935
2	How many miles tall is Mount Everest?			5.5
3	What percentage of the atmosphere is oxygen by weight?			21%
4	The first European printing press was invented in what year?			1450
5	What percentage of all electricity consumed by U.S. households in 2001 was used by kitchen appliances?			26.7%
6	What percentage of a square could be covered by a circle of the same width?			78.5%
7	In what year did Isaac Newton publish the universal laws of gravitation?			1685
8	At how many miles per hour can a peregrine falcon fly in a dive?			200
9	How many calories are in 8 ounces of orange juice?			120
10	How many people were permanently evacuated after the Chernobyl nuclear power plant accident?			135,000

80% confidence intervals



Reflections

If the intervals you gave **were** 80% confidence intervals, for how many questions would you expect (on average) the answer to fall within the intervals?

Why do you think that most people scored less than 8?

What can we take from this?

If you repeated the exercise, on a different set of questions, what might you do differently?

The outside view and using 'base rates'

Outside View

Harry Kane exclusive: England captain believes Three Lions can win 2022 World Cup in Qatar

England captain Harry Kane exclusively tells *Sky Sports* ahead of 2022 World Cup: "I look back at England 10, 15 years ago and it was almost [like] we were scared to say we wanted to win it. We're going to this tournament to win it because we believe we can"

() Wednesday 16 November 2022 16:21, UK

World Cup 2022 Predictions () Opta				
	QF	SF	Final	WINNER
1 Brazil	63.7%	40.2%	25.3%	15.8%
2 Argentina	55.3%	36.3%	21.1%	12.6%
3 France	58.8%	37.3%	21.9%	12.2%
4 Spain	55.1%	31.6%	17.4%	9.1%
➡ 5 England	56%	30.9%	17%	8.7%
6 Germany	51%	28.7%	15.4%	7.8%
7 Netherlands	53.1%	27.5%	14%	7.2%
8 Portugal	47.2%	24.1%	12.2%	5.8%
9 Belgium	41.6%	22.2%	11.3%	5.4%
10 Denmark	39.3%	19.4%	8.5%	3.5%

https://www.skysports.com/football/news/11095/12746843/harry-kane-exclusive-england-captain-believes-three-lions-can-win-2022-world-cup-in-qatar

https://www.bbc.co.uk/sport/football/63489985#:~:text=According%20to%20the%20model%2C%20England,the%20tournament%20overall%20(9%25).





CABLE CAR SMASHUP—Burned and wracked autos are strewn along San Francisco's rain-slick Hyde St. after cable car plunged three blocks down the hill when cable slipped Sunday night. At right, two passersby examine front of the car, which sustained comparatively little damage.

South African Gets New Life From Woman Dead in Crash

CAPE TOWN, South Africa—A South African hospital Sunday mades medical history with the world's first human heart transplant. Surgeons removed the heart of a young woman who died after an automobile crash and placed it in the cheat of a 55-year-old man, dying of heart damage, a hospital anonucement said.

When the transplanted heart was n place, it was started beating by an lectric shock, said Dr. Jan H. Louw, hospital chief surgeon. He added: "It was like turning the ignition switch of a car." Groote Schuur Hospital said the man was in satisfactory condition late Sunday, but that the next few days would be a critical period. Heart Removed From Body The heart was removed from the body of Denise Ann Darvall, 25, an accounting machine operator at a bank, and transferred to Louis Washkansky, a wholesale grocer, the hospital said.

Wahkansiy, aw wholease groups of the second second

stré was normal by Sunday afterdoon. In the first stage of the heart transplant operation, both Washanskyr and the body of Miss Darvall a wmashe

kansky and the body of Miss Darvall in Wreason were put on heart-lung machines, each manned by a team of technicians. Washkansky nearly took place last Wednesday with another donor but What chance did the surgeon give his patient?

"What chance do you give him" asked the patients wife "An 80% chance" replied Barnard

18 days later the patient died

"Around 60 percent of new restaurants fail within the first year. And nearly 80 percent shutter before their fifth anniversary."

https://www.cnbc.com/2016/01/20/heres-the-real-reason-why-mostrestaurants-fail.html

"42% of marriages end in divorce"

Relate factsheet

"70% of all projects fail to deliver what was promised to customers."

https://teamstage.io/project-management-statistics/ [dose of salt required]

"...about half of new hires fail within 18 months"

https://sowelo.eu/unsuccessful-recruitment/ [salt again]

"...between 70 and 90 percent of acquisitions fail"

https://hbr.org/2020/03/dont-make-this-common-ma-mistake

"On average, large IT projects run 45 percent over budget and 7 percent over time, while delivering 56 percent less value than predicted".

https://www.mckinsey.com/business-functions/mckinsey-digital/ourinsights/delivering-large-scale-it-projects-on-time-on-budget-and-on-value

Pick an appropriate comparison; use this as a 'base rate' and <u>then</u> work out why your case is different

How likely is it that your plan will succeed?

All decisions are an **uncertain bet** on the future. Being explicit about this can help decision makers

But we create incentives that play to our in-built – and well-known optimism. We make people bid for funding, write business cases, convince panels (etc)

The case they have to make is both **positive** ('back this because...') and **'inside out'** ('<u>we</u>'ll be good at this, because...'). Both are bad for planning

So can we use **'outside in'** thinking?

Why should your project be any more / less successful than is usual for this type of activity? Why do you think you're different to the 'base rate'? **Even simpler:**

Ask someone who knows this area of work well, but who has no stake in your success, what they think your chances are



National Elicitation Exercise

Overview of model



77 hospital activities in 8 groups

	Type of mitigation						
Hospital activity group	A&E attendance avoidance	Inpatient admission avoidance	Length of stay reduction	Outpatient attendance avoidance	Outpatient delivery mode	Total	
Emergency department and acute medicine activity	12		4			16	
Hospital activity amenable to medicines managements		5				5	
Hospital activity amenable to primary care and community		10	4			14	
Hospital activity amenable to psychiatric liaison and community psychiatry		3	1			4	
Hospital activity amenable to public health interventions		6				6	
Planned medical activity (adult)				2	1	3	
Planned surgical activity (adult)		7	13	2	1	23	
Planned paediatric activity				4	2	6	
Total	12	31	22	8	4	77	

Methodology

Ethical approval

Frame the forecasting for England (not a specific hospital)

Recruitment of domain experts via Transformation Directorate of NHP

Training – overview of NHP Model and probabilistic forecasting

Data collection – online app - round 1 and round 2

Final Analysis – round 2 (n=17 experts)

Min experts making a forecast = 3 or 4 (10% of forecasts) Median = 10 Max = 13

Literature suggests 6-12 is usually adequate

Online NEE app with data at England level only



N=77 parameters with age sex standardisation where appropriate

Example individual & aggregate forecasts

Hospital activity ameanable to primary care and community interventions : inpatient admission avoidance expert views (80% confidence intervals)



aggregate — expert



aggregate - expert

Hospital activity ameanable to primary care and community interventions : inpatient admission avoidance expert views (80% confidence intervals)

Rationale for P10 values

Lack of preventive mechanisms. Examples were poor access to primary care, lack of education, and insufficient community and social care resource. Other comments were citing a lack of alternatives to substitute or relocate care to out of hospital settings, inefficiencies in current care practices and the challenges of redirecting care. For instance, SMEs highlighted insufficient investment in digital technology to support monitoring and remote consultations in the management of long-term conditions as well as the inadequate staffing of frailty multidisciplinary teams.

Rationale for P90 values

Some of the key themes related to preventive measures such as future government policy and public health management initiatives resulting in improvements to housing, heating, nutrition, and transport as well as measures to reduce obesity, loneliness, alcohol consumption and smoking. Other common factors for preventive mechanisms included improved access to primary and dental care, significant investment in community services and social care and improved chronic disease management



"The prevalent tendency to **underweight or ignore distributional information** is perhaps the major source of error in forecasting. Planners should therefore make every effort to frame the forecasting problem so as to facilitate utilizing all the distributional information that is available." (p. 251)

"This may be considered the single most important piece of advice regarding how to increase accuracy in forecasting through improved methods. Using such distributional information from other ventures similar to that being forecasted is called taking an "**outside view**" and is the cure to the planning fallacy." (p. 251)

Inside vs Outside view

D Khaneman. Thinking, Fast and Slow



Share your insights...





So what... (any scope for application)



One wish...